

	ESL	TBE (Transitional Bilingual)	DBE/DL-TWI Developmental Bilingual or Dual Language
Program infrastructure	Characterized by push-in or pull-out.	Often is only implemented for 3 years	Must be implemented K-5
Teacher requirements	ESL certified teachers	Bilingual certified teachers	Bilingual certified teachers
Student integration	Integrates ELLs with native English speakers for most of the day except for when ELLs are pulled out.	Serves ELLs exclusively until transition when ELLs are exited and are often viewed as monolingual general education students.	Integrates English language learners with native English speakers and equalizes the status of the two groups.
Philosophy	Typically adopts a subtractive (deficit) approach.	Typically adopts a subtractive (deficit) approach.	Typically adopts an additive or asset-based approach.
Attitudes and outcomes	Home languages and home culture are often lost or sacrificed.	Parents often refuse the program.	Elevates the non-English language. Program often has waiting lists.
Cost	Most expensive form of teaching ELLs	(Home languages and home culture are often lost or sacrificed.)	A cost efficient way of educating ELLs.
Students	Serves a variety of English language learners.	Serves large numbers of speakers of the same non-English language, sequential and simultaneous bilinguals.	Serves Spanish Language Learners (SLLs) and English Language Learners (ELLs); sequential and simultaneous bilinguals
Assessment	Assesses only in English.	Initially assesses in Spanish and then transitions to assessments only in English.	Should assess across both languages in all grades.
Goals	Literacy and academic achievement in English.	Literacy and academic achievement in English.	Biliteracy and academic achievement in Spanish and English.